The Prohibition of Asking Positions in Hadith: Perspectives from Banjarmasin City Ulama

Muhammad Torieq Abdillah
Universitas Islam Negeri Antasari Banjarmasin
mtabdillah11@gmail.com

Hayatun Na’imah
Universitas Islam Negeri Antasari Banjarmasin
hayatunna’imah@uin-antasari.ac.id

Abstract: This research was conducted in the city of Banjarmasin against the backdrop of political turmoil during the 2020 Pilkada for Mayor and Deputy Mayor of Banjarmasin. The Pilkada results were disputed and reported to the South Kalimantan Bawaslu and the Constitutional Court. Moreover, there are numerous hadiths that address the prohibition of seeking positions of power. If interpreted literally, these hadiths clearly prohibit such actions, making it essential to seek the opinions of scholars, including those from Banjarmasin City. This empirical juridical research, employing a legal sociology approach, involved eight Banjarmasin city scholars as subjects and focused on the hadith concerning the prohibition of seeking positions as the object. The study was conducted through observation, interviews, and documentation, followed by data collection and descriptive analysis. The results indicate that the majority of Banjarmasin City scholars interpret the hadith on the prohibition of seeking positions both textually and contextually. These scholars adhere to the interpretations (syarah) of previous scholars. Furthermore, the majority believe that running for leadership in a democratic system and asking for office can be either the same or different, depending on the specific conditions. Some scholars see similarities between the two, while others do not.

Keywords: Ban; Asking for Positions; Hadith; Ulama of Banjarmasin City

How to cite this article: Muhammad Torieq Abdillah and others, The Prohibition of Asking Positions in Hadith: Perspectives from Banjarmasin City Ulama, Jurnal Ilmiah Mizani: Wacana Hukum, Ekonomi Dan Keagamaan, 11.1 (2024), 92-100
Introduction

Allah Subhanahu wa ta’ala created humans to govern the earth, emphasizing their essential role as leaders. Leadership is crucial for guiding and educating, as well as understanding the dynamics behind organizational success and failure.\(^1\)

Regarding humans created by Allah Subhanahu wa ta’ala as leaders on Earth, it has been described in Surah Al-Baqarah: 30:

“Behold, thy Lord said to the angels; ‘I will create a vicegerent on earth.’ They said: ‘Wilt Thou place therein one who will make mischief therein and shed blood? Whilst we do celebrate Thy praises and glorify Thy holy (name)!’ He said: ‘I know what ye know not’.\(^2\)”

Allah Subhanahu wa ta’ala's verse emphasizes humans' destined leadership roles. Rasulullah shallallahu ‘alaihi wa sallam embodied both religious and political leadership in Islam, disseminating da’wah and governing Medina. His passing sparked debates among companions about leadership succession (siyasah), revealing varied opinions on the rightful successor.\(^3\)

Since then, there have been ongoing debates about the rightful successor to Rasulullah shallallahu ‘alaihi wa sallam and how the electoral system should be structured. Consequently, Abu Bakr ash-Shiddiq, ‘Umar ibn al-Khatthab, ‘Uthman ibn ‘Affan, and ‘Ali ibn Abi Talib radhiyallahu ‘anhu successively assumed leadership after Rasulullah shallallahu ‘alaihi wa sallam. Each had their own method of being appointed as khalifah: Abu Bakr ash-Shiddiq radhiyallahu ‘anhu became khalifah through deliberation,\(^4\) ‘Umar ibn al-Khatthab radhiyallahu ‘anhu through testament,\(^5\) ‘Uthman ibn ‘Affan radhiyallahu ‘anhu through deliberation\(^6\) and ‘Ali ibn Abi Talib radhiyallahu ‘anhu through direct allegiance.\(^7\) Over time, the system of government and the appointment of the khalifah also evolved.

After ‘Ali ibn Abi Talib radhiyallahu ‘anhu, the Umayyad Dynasty commenced. Prior to the Umayyad Dynasty, various nations worldwide had already established their distinct forms of government and political systems. Examples include monarchies (nations governed by a king or queen), oligarchies (governments controlled by a few individuals or groups), and democracies (where power resides with the people).\(^8\) The Umayyad Dynasty itself was a monarchy, and during that period, many monarchies existed worldwide.

There is historical evidence from ancient times indicating that the system of government led by Muslims was not democratic. This is closely related to the history of Islamic civilization in the Middle East and North Africa. An often-presented  


\(^7\) Khalid Muhammad Khalid, Biografi Khalifah Rasulullah: Abu Bakar, Umar, Utsman, Ali, Dan Umar Bin Abdul Aziz, trans. Tim Penerjemah Ummul Qura (Jakarta Timur: Ummul Qura, 2016), 469.

argument is that Islam and democracy are not compatible.\(^9\)

In today's democratic landscape, politics in Indonesia is synonymous with disruption. Ambitious individuals compete intensely, employing varied strategies to secure advantageous positions. This drive is fueled by a societal preference for instant results, amplified by rapid technological advancements. The historical teachings of hadith, as relayed by scholars like Imam Al-Bukhari and Imam Muslim, underscore Rasulullah shallallahu 'alaihi wa sallam's prohibition against seeking positions of power, reflecting fundamental Islamic principles on leadership and responsibility:

Muhammad ibn ‘Abdullah narrated to us, ‘Utsman ibn ‘Umar ibn Faris narrated to us, Ibn ‘Aun ibn al-Hasan reported to us from ‘Abdurrahman bin Samurah, who said: Rasulullah shallallahu ‘alaihi wa sallam said, “Do not ask for leadership (position). If you are given it without asking for it, you will be helped. However, if you are given leadership because you asked for it, then you will be left without a helper. And if you have sworn an oath and see that something else is better, then do what is better and make atonement for your oath.” (Hadith reported by al-Bukhari: 6.722)\(^10\)

The above hadith clearly forbids seeking office directly. However, in Indonesia's current political milieu, many vie for executive positions, driven by a desire to engage in politics within the Pancasila democratic system. This system upholds freedoms and legal protections, allowing individuals to nominate themselves for leadership roles through direct elections. While the hadith prohibits seeking power, Indonesia's electoral process necessitates campaigning and garnering votes. This juxtaposition highlights the intricate relationship between religious teachings and political practices in Indonesia.

Political dynamics in Indonesia are often tumultuous, as illustrated by the 2020 mayoral election in Banjarmasin. The contentious race between Hj. Ananda and H. Mushaffa Zakir against H. Ibnu Sina and H. Arifin Noor was marred by allegations of fraud. Hj. Ananda and H. Mushaffa Zakir submitted substantial evidence of irregularities to the South Kalimantan Bawaslu, triggering an investigation under the electoral laws outlined in Law Number 7 of 2017. Subsequently, they pursued legal recourse by appealing to the Constitutional Court (MK) after the initial election results favored their opponents. Despite their efforts, the court dismissed their case due to insufficient evidence of widespread fraud, affirming H. Ibnu Sina and H. Arifin Noor as the rightful winners of the 2020 mayoral election in Banjarmasin.\(^11\)

The case illustrates the intense political turmoil surrounding local elections, exemplified by the 2020 mayoral race in Banjarmasin. This reflects broader challenges in Indonesia's political landscape, as noted by Fadholi, Secretary of the Nasdem Party faction, during a 2015 seminar in Makassar. Fadholi highlighted the country's pervasive regional power struggles across numerous regencies and cities, which often overshadow crucial economic and social issues due to

---

competing priorities.\textsuperscript{12} The mentioned case highlights the intense political tensions surrounding mayoral and deputy mayoral elections. During the National Seminar of the Nasdem Party faction in Makassar on June 6, 2015, Fadholi, the party's Secretary, emphasized Indonesia's ongoing struggles with power dynamics. He pointed out that the country's numerous regencies and cities are constantly embroiled in regional power contests, diverting attention away from pressing economic, social, and other critical issues that remain inadequately addressed.\textsuperscript{13}

According to urban sociology, urban societies are modern and highly rational, contrasting with traditional societies. This rationality promotes heterogeneity within urban communities, fostering openness to diverse perspectives. This framework extends to include the ulama in Banjarmasin city, known for its heterogeneous society. Therefore, the diverse thinking and roles of the ulama in Banjarmasin are crucial in interpreting the aforementioned hadith. This interpretation is essential to reconcile the perceived conflict between Indonesia's democratic system and the hadith's prohibition against seeking office. Detailed interviews with Banjarmasin's ulama are imperative to provide a comprehensive explanation of these issues.

\textbf{Literature Review}

Research conducted by Fadilla Rahmi (2021), entitled "Requesting a Position in the Process of Choosing Leaders in Indonesia According to the Perspective of Islamic Constitutional Law," discusses the process of asking for positions according to Indonesian laws and regulations and from the perspective of Islamic constitutional law. The study concludes that asking for positions is prohibited by Allah Subhanahu wa ta’ala. Additionally, the study reveals that society holds diverse opinions on the matter. However, according to Islamic law, two key considerations are essential: if an individual possesses the necessary capacity, then seeking a position is acceptable, and the primary motivation must be to seek the pleasure of Allah Subhanahu wa ta’ala.\textsuperscript{14}

Another research conducted by Radiyat Mahlupi (2022), entitled “Requesting a Position in the Perspective of Islamic Politics (Analysis of Surah Yusuf Verses 54-55),” examines the request for office from the perspective of political Islam by analyzing Surah Yusuf: 54-55. This study concludes that there is no prohibition on asking for a position, as every individual has the right to occupy a position provided they have the competence to be an ideal leader in Islam.\textsuperscript{15}

\textbf{Methods}

This type of research is a form of Empirical Legal Research that examines the law through actual behavior and as a social phenomenon that is not documented, but experienced by everyone in social relationships. This research utilizes a sociology of law approach, analyzing how reactions and interactions occur when the normative system operates within society.\textsuperscript{16}


\textsuperscript{14} FADILLA RAHMI, 'Meminta Jabatan Dalam Proses Memilih Pemimpin Di Indonesia Menurut Perspektif Hukum Tata Negara Islam', 2021.

\textsuperscript{15} Radiyat Mahlupi, 'MEMINTA JABATAN DALAM PERSPEKTIF POLITIK ISLAM (ANALISIS SURAH YUSUF AYAT 54-55)' (Syariah, 24 January 2022), https://idr.uin-antasari.ac.id/18515/.

The data source for this study comprises eight ulama in Banjarmasin city, who serve as informants. The data analysis employs qualitative methods, with the collected data presented in the form of descriptive descriptions.

All data collected and processed through the aforementioned techniques undergo a detailed analysis to address the issues related to the prohibition of asking for a position as stated in the hadith, and the relationship between running for leadership in a democratic system and asking for a position. This analysis is based on in-depth interviews with the informants and is thoroughly discussed with reference to the theoretical framework.

Results and Discussion

The Opinion of Ulama of Banjarmasin City on the Prohibition of Asking for Positions in Hadith

Ulama in Banjarmasin city hold diverse views on the interpretation of the hadith concerning the prohibition of asking for positions, categorized into three main perspectives: textual, contextual, and a combination of both.17 This typology reflects their understanding of hadith. Textual interpretation involves understanding the hadith without considering its historical context, whereas contextual interpretation considers the origin and circumstances surrounding the hadith.

According to the researcher, many informants understand the hadith prohibiting asking for positions primarily in a textual manner, asserting its timeless relevance from the past to the present. They emphasize that the direct prohibition from Rasulullah shallallahu ‘alaihi wa sallam leaves no room for exceptions, aligning with traditional interpretations.

Moreover, while the approach of textual interpretation is prevalent, contextual understanding is also acknowledged, particularly in contemporary contexts. Ali Mustafa Yaqub delineates four aspects of contextual hadith understanding: reasons for revelation (asbab al-nuzul), time and place (makan wa zaman), causal relationships (‘illat al-kalam), and sociocultural factors.18

Ahmadi Hasan supports the textual understanding, arguing that seeking leadership without ulterior motives and with the capability to serve effectively is permissible and aligned with prophetic teachings.19 Conversely, contextual views, such as those of Asfiani Norhasani, delve into the biographical nuances of narrators and historical contexts,20 suggesting that the hadith's application should consider the character and intentions of the aspirants.21

The majority consensus among informants is that the hadith can be understood both textually and contextually, balancing the timeless guidance with practical applications in varying historical and societal contexts.22 This nuanced understanding is crucial, especially in democratic systems like Indonesia's, where

19 M. Alfatih Suryadilaga, Metodologi Syarah Hadis Dari Klasik Hingga Kontemporer (Sleman: Kalimedia, 2017), 118.
22 Zamakhshyari, Teori-Teori Hukum Islam Dalam Fiqih Dan Ushul Fiqih (Bandung: Citapustaka Media Perintis, 2013), 36.
leadership is sought through elections guided by constitutional and legal frameworks.23

To summarize, while textual adherence to the hadith is foundational, contextual insights provide necessary flexibility and relevance in contemporary governance. This multifaceted approach ensures that Islamic principles guide leadership aspirations within the framework of democratic governance, respecting both religious tradition and legal imperatives.

Table 1. Perspectives of Ulama in Banjarmasin City on the Hadith Prohibiting Asking for Positions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perspective</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Textual</td>
<td>Emphasizes direct prohibition from Rasulullah shallallahu 'alaihi wa sallam without contextual exceptions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextual</td>
<td>Considers historical context, including biographical and situational aspects of the hadith's narration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td>Integrates textual guidance with contextual application, balancing timeless principles with contemporary relevance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 summarizes ulama perspectives in Banjarmasin City on the hadith prohibiting asking for positions. This integrated approach ensures that Islamic teachings are upheld while accommodating the practicalities of modern governance, reflecting the evolving discourse among ulama in Banjarmasin city and beyond.

Perspective of Ulama of Banjarmasin City on Leaders Seeking Office and Running in a Democratic System

In examining the perspective of Banjarmasin's ulama regarding leaders seeking and running for office within a democratic framework, three distinct viewpoints emerge. Firstly, there is a general consensus suggesting an equivalence between seeking leadership in a democratic system and soliciting office. Secondly, some argue for a complete dissociation between the two, asserting that leadership attainment should solely depend on qualifications, regardless of the process. Lastly, an opinion exists that conditions the similarity based on factors such as position type, timing, and the operational dynamics of the system.

Table 2. Perspective of Ulama of Banjarmasin City on Leaders Seeking Office and Running in a Democratic System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Informant</th>
<th>Perspective on Seeking Office and Running for Leadership in Democratic System</th>
<th>Analysis and Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rusydi Rusli</td>
<td>Views leadership in a democratic system as akin to asking for office, citing the hadith's prohibition and severe consequences for such actions.</td>
<td>Emphasizes adherence to religious teachings against seeking positions of power directly, regardless of the democratic context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husaini Sahlan</td>
<td>Asserts that running for office is essentially asking for a position due to the independent intent to lead, candidacy and except when soliciting support conforming to legal versus direct self-norms through nomination for independent support.</td>
<td>Highlights the distinction between a position due to the independent intent to lead, candidacy and except when soliciting support conforming to legal versus direct self-norms through nomination for independent support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Umar ibn al-Khatthab</td>
<td>Argues against equivalence, emphasizing that leadership should be based solely on demonstrated capacity rather than the act of seeking office.</td>
<td>Advocates for merit-based leadership selection, suggesting that capability should determine candidacy rather than active solicitation of office.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 details various ulama perspectives in Banjarmasin City on the issue of leaders seeking office within a democratic system. This diversity of perspectives underscores the complex interplay between Islamic teachings and contemporary democratic norms in Indonesia. While the hadith's prohibition on seeking office remains a guiding principle, the nuances in modern political contexts necessitate careful consideration of legal frameworks and societal demands. The integration of Islamic principles with democratic practices reflects ongoing scholarly and societal dialogue on governance and leadership ethics.

**Conclusion**

Most ulama from Banjarmasin city, comprising six out of eight, interpret the hadith prohibiting seeking office both textually and contextually. However, one ulama insists on a strictly textual interpretation, while another emphasizes a contextual understanding. Regarding their perspectives, the ulama of Banjarmasin city engage in discussions referencing the interpretations of earlier scholars, with one ulama maintaining a stance independently but still aligning with traditional interpretations.

The majority opinion among the ulama of Banjarmasin city, totaling five out of eight, argues that leaders who seek office and run for office in a democratic system can be considered the same or different based on specific conditions prevailing at the time. Two ulama suggest similarities between seeking office and running for office in a democratic setup, viewing both as attempts to assume leadership roles, even under democratic processes. Conversely, one ulama argues against equating seeking...
office with running for office in a democratic system, emphasizing the need for leadership capacity and ethical considerations beyond mere candidacy.

In understanding the advice derived from these perspectives, it is generally recommended to interpret hadiths, including those prohibiting seeking positions, with attention to both textual and contextual contexts. While some scholars lean towards textual interpretations, others emphasize contextual understandings, contingent upon the specific hadith in question.

Overall, aspiring to leadership roles requires meeting established criteria and embodying the qualities outlined in the laws and principles of leadership exemplified by Rasulullah shallallahu ‘alaihi wa sallam. Hence, attaining leadership positions involves more than mere aspiration; it necessitates adherence to procedural stages and mechanisms prescribed by the state or principles espoused in Islam.

Credit Authorship Contribution
Muhammad Torieq Abdillah: study design, investigation, draft preparation, supervision. Hayatun Na’imah: study design, resources provision, review, editing.

Declaration of Competing Interest
The authors declare no competing interests related to this study. No financial or personal conflicts of interest are present.

Data Availability
Data are not available for sharing.

Acknowledgements
The authors thank Universitas Islam Negeri Antasari Banjarmasin for their support and resources.

References


Kandahlawy, Syaikh Muhammad Yusuf al-
Sirah Shahabat: Keteladanan Orang-
Orang Di Sekitar Nabi. Translated by
Kathur Suhardi. Jakarta Timur: Pustaka
Al-Kautsar, 1999.

Katsir, Al-Hafizh Ibnu, and Abu Ihsan al-
Atsari. Perjalanan Hidup Empat Khalifah
Rasul Yang Agung. Jakarta: Darul Haq,
2014.

Khalid, Khalid Muhammad. Biografi Khalifah
Rasulullah: Abu Bakar, Umar, Utsman,
Ali, Dan Umar Bin Abdul Aziz. Translated
by Tim Penerjemah Ummul Qura.
Jakarta Timur: Ummul Qura, 2016.

Mahlupi, Radiyat. ‘MEMINTA JABATAN
DALAM PERSPEKTIF POLITIK ISLAM
(ANALISIS SURAH YUSUF AYAT 54-55)’.
Syariah, 24 January 2022. https://idr.uin-
antasari.ac.id/18515/.

Mawardi, Imam al-
Al-Ahкам as-
Sulthaniyyah:
Hukum-Hukum
Penyelenggaraan Negara Dalam Syariят
Islam. Translated by Fadli Bahri. Jakarta:

Muhammad, Metode Penelitian Hukum.
Mataram: Mataram University Press,
2020.

Novita, Cicik. ‘Macam-Macam Bentuk
Pemerintahan di Dunia: Monarki Hingga
Demokrasi’. tirto.id. Accessed 27
January 2023. https://tirto.id/macam-
macam-bentuk-pemerintahan-di-dunia-
monarki-hingga-demokrasi-f9u7.

RAHMI, FADILLA. ‘Meminta Jabatan Dalam
Proses Memilih Pemimpin Di Indonesia
Menurut Perspektif Hukum Tata Negara

RI, Sekretariat Jenderal MPR. ‘Indonesia
Disibukkan Dengan Perebutan
Kekuasaan’. mpr.go.id. Accessed 27
January 2023. https://www.mpr.go.id/berita/indonesia-
disibukkan-dengan-perebutan-
kekuasaan.

RM.ID. ‘2 Kali Gugat, Tetap Kalah Di MK
AnandaMu Legowo Keok Di Pilkada
January 2023. https://rm.id/baca-
berita/pilkada/80319/2-kali-gugat-tetap-
kalah-di-mk-anandamu-legowo-keok-di-
pilkada-banjarmasin.

Schneier, Edward. Muslim Democracy:
Politics, Religion and Society in Indonesia,
Turkey and the Islamic World.
Routledge, 2015.

Sidiq, Umar. ‘Kepemimpinan Dalam Islam:
Kajian Tematik Dalam Al-Quran Dan

Simamora, Janpatak. ‘Ekstensif Pemilukada
Dalam Rangka Mewujudkan
Pemerintahan Daerah Yang
Demokratis’. Mimbar Hukum-Fakultas
Hukum Universitas Gadjah Mada 23, no. 1

Suryadilaga, M. Alfatih. Metodologi Syarah
Hadis Dari Klasik Hingga Kontemporer.

Suyuthi, Imam as-
Tarikh Al-Khulafa:
Ensiкlopedia Pemimpin Umat Islam Dari
Abu Bakar Hingga Mutawakkil.
Translated by Fachry. Jakarta Selatan:

Wahdini, Muhammad. Pengantar Metodologi
Penelitian Hukum. Yogyakarta: Penerbit

Wijaya, Firad, Andri Afriani, and IAIH Anjani
Lombok Timur. ‘Pendekatan Tekstual
Dan Kontekstual Dalam Study Hadist’.
JOURNAL OF ALIFBATA: Journal of Basic

Zamakhsyari. Teori-Teori Hukum Islam Dalam
Fiqih Dan Ushul Fiqih. Bandung:
Citapustaka Media Perintis, 2013.